

Notice: This material may be
protected by copyright law.
(Title 17, U.S. Code)

Mr B. Mannathoko, District Officer Lands, Kweneng, queried when was the best time to conduct an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA). At what level or stage? Before or after the developer has started?

Mr Mpotokwane responded that the EIA should be done when the developer presents his proposal. If the developer does not meet environmental specifications and considerations, then Government should firmly turn the company down.

Regarding noise pollution and the Kasane Airport, he felt an EIA should be done on the airport.

Regarding the proliferation of lodges and camps in northern Botswana, he conceded that this is a cause for concern.

The Chairman, Mr B. Egner, concluded the session by stating that the EIA was an important component of development, that it should be part of the licence application for camps and hotels, and that an EIA should be done before building any more airports.

Regarding the litter problem, Mr Egner said that the beer and soft drink industry and construction companies should be held responsible. He felt people should be made to pay for pollution. Someone must make a start somewhere. We need responsible profit-makers.

TOURISM AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT AMONG REMOTE AREA POPULATIONS IN BOTSWANA

Dr Robert K. Hitchcock
University of Nebraska

INTRODUCTION

Tourism has been recommended as a strategy for sustainable development by numerous governments and international development agencies. According to the World Tourism Organisation, greater emphasis is being placed on 'responsible tourism', recreational activities which pose little threat to the habitats or the societies that are visited. This kind of tourism is supposed to be designed in such a way that it actually enhances the quality of life for the hosts while providing educational benefits to the guests.

Smith (1977) notes that tourism can be a significant factor in bringing about cultural change. This is particularly true of what Smith (1977) defines as 'ethnic tourism', visits paid to traditional or indigenous populations which are in remote places and which retain, at least to a certain extent, many of their customs and lifestyles. The effects of visits on people who live in out-of-the-way places are often substantial. While tourism may provide income and employment opportunities for local people, it can also cause social difficulties.

The social, economic and environmental impacts of tourism on local populations in remote areas are subjects that are receiving increasing attention from scientists and development planners (Smith, 1977; Wu, 1982; Johnston, 1990). Investigations have been done of tourism effects among a number of indigenous populations, including the Cuna (Kuna) Indians of Panama (Swain, 1977; Chapin, 1990), Native Americans in the south-western United States (Browne and Nolan, 1989), Australian Aborigines (Altman, 1989), and San (Basarwa, Bushmen) of the Kalahari Desert region of southern African (Gordon, 1990; Hitchcock and Brandenburgh, 1990). A general conclusion of these studies is that tourism can have positive effects if local people are able to participate in tourist-related businesses and if they have some say in decisions regarding the frequency, number and types of tourists who enter their communities.

Tourism can often be problematic for local people, especially in situations where the host population is extremely poor. It is not

(1991) Tourism in Botswana
Gaborene: Botswana Society

no 161-
170

ed. Linda Potenhauer

uncommon for dependency relationships to be created. In some cases, resident groups go to extraordinary lengths to meet the needs of tourists. Occasionally, individuals give up other kinds of economic activities such as agriculture or hunting. There are also situations in which people abandon their values and shed their dignity in their quest for the cash that tourists provide. While tourism may indeed expand incomes and create additional employment opportunities, it also causes social stratification and exacerbates problems of factionalism within local communities. Thus, there are differences of opinion among groups visited by tourists as to the balance between benefits and costs.

The Republic of Botswana provides a number of useful illustrations of the socio-economic and environmental impacts of tourism in remote areas. Tourism companies market Botswana as being a kind of 'unspoiled Eden' where people can see large numbers of elephants, lions and other wildlife as well as groups of people who supposedly continue to hunt and gather 'as they have always done'. The majority of people who visit the Kalahari Desert and Okavango Delta regions of Botswana are what Johnson (1976) describes as 'do-it-yourself' tourists who place high value on viewing wildlife and people in their 'natural state'.

Much of the tourism in Botswana can be described as environmental tourism or 'ecotourism'. Campbell and von Richter (1976) note that Botswana's tourist industry is based largely upon wildlife. As a result, the major tourist destinations tend to be the Okavango Delta and the various national parks and game reserves (see Appendix 1). Since the numbers of people living in these areas tend to be small, most of the contact between tourists and resident populations consist of situations in which local people serve as guides (Almagor, 1985). Cash flows into rural communities, but generally in very small amounts.

There are also tourists who visit Botswana in order to see 'exotic' peoples, particularly the San (Basarwa, Bushmen) of the Kalahari. Excited by the prospect of visiting what are marketed as 'some of the world's last hunter-gatherers', tourists arrange with safari companies to go to such places as the Tsodilo Hills and the Central Kalahari Game Reserve. The purpose of these visits, according to many of the tourists who make them, is to experience an exotic culture and see people who still pursue their 'age-old lifestyles'.

Ethnic tourism poses a number of dilemmas for local people. On the one hand they have the opportunity to get jobs and generate some cash through sales of crafts or demonstrations of activities such as dancing or gathering wild plants. On the other hand, tourists sometimes interfere with local people's daily activities, and they are

not always aware of the appropriate ways to behave. Ethnic tourists often come in to remote areas with preconceived notions of what to expect. Not always finding what they hoped for, they occasionally resort to bullying tactics.

Government administrators and planners in Botswana have been concerned about the issue of local people being the objects of tourist curiosity for decades. Concern was heightened in the 1970s as more and more tourists visited remote parts of the country. In 1975, the Ministry of Local Government and Lands issued a statement concerning 'Bushmen and Tourism' (Savangram LG. 1/3, 29 April, 1975). The basic theme of the document was that tourists represented a problem for rural citizens since local people had little ability to control the manner of their contact with outsiders.

Discussions with San and other remote area people revealed that they were sometimes asked to remove their western clothing so that they might be photographed in what tourists felt to be their 'traditional' garb. A second concern was that tourists sometimes gave tobacco, liquor, and other goods to local people, thus creating dependency situations. A major problem cited by local people was that tourists rarely, if ever, asked permission to visit their communities; instead, they simply drove in and began walking around their homes. As a consequence, people complained that their privacy was being invaded.

Both the Government and local people sought ways to ensure that tourism could be controlled. This was not easy in rural communities where people do not have exclusive rights over their areas. At one rural community, Ka/Gae in Ghanzi District, tourists were handed sheets of paper which said, 'You are not welcome here'. At the Tsodilo Hills, they were given brochures which outlined the prices to be paid for handicrafts. Local leaders sometimes approached tourists and requested that they treat people with respect.

IMPACTS OF TOURISM AMONG REMOTE AREA POPULATIONS

A primary reason cited by Botswana Government planners for increasing tourism in Botswana is that it generates employment and income generating opportunities. There is no question that some remote area populations have been able to get cash for their services and through sales of craft items. In the Tsodilo Hills area, for example, it was estimated in 1976 that the average annual income of Ju/Wa (!Kung) households involved in the tourist industry was approximately P600-P800. A !Xo community in the western part of Kgalagadi District estimated that they made approximately P5,000 in

1989 from visits by a single safari company.

The different amounts of cash flowing into local households can sometimes cause disagreements. This kind of situation arose in the Diphuduhudu area of Kweneng District, where some families who worked closely with a safari company had disputes with other community members who felt that they were getting fewer opportunities to earn income. Tourism can sometimes increase tensions and exacerbate ethnic conflicts, as well. In the Tsodilo Hills, for example, the Mbukushu residing in the area also got payments from tourists, but the amounts were substantially less than those of their Ju/Wasi neighbours. As one man put it, "Why is it that all the tourists only come to Tsodilo to see Bushmen?"

Remote area populations in Botswana are divided in their opinions about tourism. Some people feel that tourism is useful in that it enables them to make some extra money. Others feel that they have little control over the actions of tourists, and they resent the intrusions in their lives. According to a number of people, tourist vehicles sometimes destroy plants upon which they depend for part of their subsistence. The sounds of Toyota Landcruisers and Landrovers crashing through the bush on the way to remote communities also frighten away game. There have been reports of situations in which tourists went into remote parts of the Kalahari with few supplies, hoping that they could 'rough it', or, if necessary, ask local people for food and water. For people who see themselves as having few resources, having rich tourists ask them for what little they had was extremely disconcerting.

Judging from the experiences of people in the north-eastern Kweneng District and Central Kalahari Game Reserve regions of Botswana, tourism can affect the degree of social harmony in local communities. One of the difficulties of a tourism-based industry is that the breadth of participation in the benefits tends to be somewhat skewed. The people who benefit the most frequently are adult males who are multilingual and who have had some experience in dealing with outsiders. It is these people who often end up working for tour operators or providing assistance to visitors. In the central and south-eastern Kalahari area, the people who get most of the benefits from tourists are men who have worked on the mines in South Africa and who speak Afrikaans.

Another problem with tourism has to do with interpersonal conflict between members of the host communities and visitors. Numerous people mentioned that they resent tourists who do not greet them or come to them personally to explain what their purpose is in coming to their areas. A common complaint is that tourists do not treat local people as they would members of their own groups.

"Why is it", they ask "that we are requested to take off our clothes so people can take pictures of us? We don't see the tourists changing their clothes for photographs".

While advocates of tourism often claim that economic benefits will accrue to local people in the form of jobs, an examination of tourist-related employment in the central and western Kalahari casts doubt on the efficacy of this argument. As local people note, the jobs that they get usually tend to be ones in which they have to perform menial tasks for other people. One !Xo from Ghanzi District told me that he was asked by the company for which he worked to run along in front of the vehicle looking for animal spoor. His worst nightmare, he said, was that the drunk hunters in the truck would shoot him instead of the animals they were after.

An examination of the data on personnel in safari companies and tour groups reveals that few people classified as remote area dwellers (RADs) are in management positions. None of these companies is owned or operated by remote area dwellers. According to some people in remote areas, tourism is literally out of their hands. It is controlled, they maintain, by private companies who prefer to have trained managers from outside the local area.

Stresses occur in remote area communities when the numbers of visitors are substantial. Some people dislike the fact that outsiders, including anthropologists, come into their villages uninvited. Others resent being requested to do disagreeable chores for tourists, such as washing their clothes or cleaning up their campsites. Often the tourists give them little in the way of recompense. As one tourist put it, "What good is it to give Bushmen money? They don't understand its value". He went on to say, "Besides, there is no place to spend it out here anyway".

Rural people respond to tourists in a variety of ways. It is not unusual to see individuals or families flocking toward tourist vehicles with handicrafts in hand. In Ghanzi, some poverty-stricken individuals beg tourists for food, something which leaves the visitors feeling uncomfortable. A Remote Area Development Officer observed that some remote area dwellers have become so tourist-oriented that they refuse to work on community projects, preferring instead to wait for visitors to come and give them food and money.

It is important to note that some remote groups have had excellent working relationships with safari companies. One tour operator who visits people in the south-eastern and central Kalahari areas is always welcome, according to Kua and G//ana informants, because he provides much needed employment. The owner of the company uses some of his profits to invest in developments in local villages. He helped purchase a donkey cart for one group which is

used to haul water in drums to their homes. He also bought seeds and tools so that people could expand their agricultural activities. This individual, along with members of a few other safari companies, has lobbied on behalf of local people, recommending that land be set aside for them and that they be provided with water and social services.

CULTURAL IMPACTS OF TOURISM

Tourism has had some significant cultural effects among remote area populations. In contrast to the notion that rapid modernisation brings about a kind of acculturation that destroys local traditions, a number of local people have become actively engaged in perpetuating customary activities. Tyua groups along the Nata River in north-eastern Botswana have more initiation rites and dances than they did in the past, in part, according to local people, because they wished to differentiate themselves from their non-Basarwa neighbours and visitors. People in several parts of the Kalahari requested help from the National Museum and Art Gallery in setting up their own museums and libraries. Some of them also asked anthropologists to provide them with information they had compiled on indigenous customs so that they could use them to develop curricula for local private schools.

Tourism in the Kalahari has served to expand the number of marketing opportunities for handicrafts. A kind of renaissance in crafts has occurred, with numerous groups producing baskets, ostrich eggshell bead necklaces, skin bags, and other items. While the handicraft industry has helped to rekindle interest in producing traditional goods, it has also had some negative economic effects, tying people to an unstable world market system. A common refrain heard in rural Botswana is that prices paid to producers are low and that profits go mainly to middlemen, some of them private companies owned by people who are not from Botswana. In the 1980s, efforts were made to increase local craft purchases and expand producer prices through the formation of such non-governmental organisations as !Kung San Crafts and Gantsicraft.

Tourism can be culturally disruptive when it causes heightened desires for economic gains that are difficult, if not impossible, to attain. In interviews of a sample of children in six different communities in the Kalahari, it was found that many of them hoped to move to town and to get well-paying jobs. When asked what they wanted for their future, several of them said, "Toyota Land Cruisers, just like the ones that tourists drive". A few of them remarked that they looked forward to having the chance to sit outside their tents in

tourist camps, eating sumptuous meals and enjoying iced drinks. While there is inherently nothing wrong with these aspirations, the chances of people achieving them are relatively small given the socio-economic conditions in the Kalahari.

Yet another difficulty is that tourism is highly seasonal, leaving people to find alternative employment in slack periods. It is a kind of feast or famine existence, according to many rural people. Without a sound economic base, people get an embarrassment of riches part of the time and little return much of the rest of the year.

CONSERVATION AND CULTURE IN THE CENTRAL KALAHARI

The area where the argument for promoting tourism in Botswana may have substantial impacts on the well-being of resident populations is the central Kalahari. The Central Kalahari Game Reserve and Kutse Game Reserve together make up the largest protected region in Botswana and one of the largest reserved areas on the African continent. The Central Kalahari Game Reserve and Kutse are favoured tourist destinations in part because of the presence of Basarwa and Bakgalagadi populations who hunt and gather for part of their subsistence (Silberbauer, 1965, 1981; Hitchcock, 1985, 1988). Another attraction of the central Kalahari is that it contains a variety of habitats and a large number of wild animal and bird species (Owens and Owens, 1981, 1984; Kalahari Conservation Society, 1988b).

In 1985, the Botswana Government called for a commission of enquiry to investigate the various options which could be pursued in the central Kalahari. The CKGR Commission reviewed evidence, interviewed district and local officials, and held meetings with residents of the Central Kalahari Game Reserve between September and November, 1985. As a result of their findings, the commission recommended that people be allowed to continue to reside in the reserve (Government of Botswana, 1985). In late 1986 this recommendation was rejected by the Ministry of Commerce and Industry. In a speech to Parliament on December 1, 1986, the Minister stated that the Government had a mandate to make decisions in the national interest and that the reserve would lose its integrity if people were allowed to stay there (*Botswana Daily News*, December 3, 1986, p 1).

Two ministers who toured the central Kalahari in mid-1988 offered several reasons as to why resettlement was necessary. First of all, they noted, the move would help ensure conservation of the resource base in the reserve. Secondly, they argued that a move to

other areas would increase people's access to social services and development assistance. Finally, they stressed that such a move would enhance the tourism potential of the region and would serve to expand economic opportunities for local people in the tourist industry. In a sense, then, conservation and tourism were being used as arguments to dispossess people in remote parts of the Kalahari.

CONCLUSIONS

Botswana already has the largest percentage of its land devoted to parks and reserves of any southern African country (International Union for the Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources, 1985; Wilkinson, 1978). Over 50,000 people could be affected by decisions to limit land use options by remote area populations (see Appendix 2). Questions remain as to what kinds of activities people living in remote areas will be able to pursue. Plans have been made by some communities such as Bere in the Ghanzi District, to set up small-scale businesses which could be geared toward wildlife management and tourism. The Government could go a long way toward enhancing rural development if it supported such grassroots activities.

In recent years there have been an increasing number of calls for alliances between local populations and conservationists. Scientists and development planners have postulated that environmental, social and economic goals can best be achieved if local people are allowed to participate in decision-making processes concerning development action. Given that one of Botswana's four main planning objectives is to promote social justice, it might well be worth the effort to reconsider some of the effects of conservation and tourism expansion policies in order to ensure that sustained and equitable development can be achieved.

REFERENCES

- Almagor, U. 1985. A Tourist's "Vision Quest" in an African Game Reserve. *Annals of Tourism Research* 12(1): 31-47.
- Altman, J. 1989. Tourism Dilemmas for Aboriginal Australians. *Annals of Tourism Research* 16(4): 456-476.
- Browne, R. and M.L. Nolan. 1989. Western Indian Reservation Tourism Development. *Annals of Tourism Research* 16(3): 360-376.
- Campbell, A.C. and W. von Richter. 1976. The Okavango Delta and Tourism. In *Proceedings of the Symposium on the Okavango Delta and its Future Utilisation*, pp. 245-247. Gaborone, Botswana: Botswana Society.

- Chapin, M. 1990. The Silent Jungle: Ecotourism among the Kuna Indians of Panama. *Cultural Survival Quarterly* 14(1): 42-45.
- Cohen, E. 1989. "Primitive and Remote" Hill Tribe Trekking in Thailand. *Annals of Tourism Research* 16(1): 30-61.
- Gordon, R. 1990. The Prospects for Anthropological Tourism in Bushmanland. *Cultural Survival Quarterly* 14(1): 6-8.
- Government of Botswana. 1985. *Report of the Central Kalahari Fact Finding Mission*. Gaborone, Botswana: Government Printer.
- Gulbrandsen, O., M. Karlsen and J. Lexow. 1986. *Remote Area Development Programme*. Gaborone, Botswana: Government Printer.
- Hitchcock, R.K. 1985. Foragers on the Move: San Survival Strategies in Botswana Parks and Reserves. *Cultural Survival Quarterly* 9(1): 31-36.
- Hitchcock, R.K. 1988. *Monitoring, Research and Development in the Remote Areas of Botswana*. Gaborone, Botswana: Government Printer.
- Hitchcock, R.K. and R.L. Brandenburgh. 1990. Tourism, Conservation and Culture in the Kalahari Desert, Botswana. *Cultural Survival Quarterly* 14(2): 20-24.
- International Union for the Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources. 1985. *1985 United Nations List of National Parks and Protected Areas*. Gland, Switzerland: IUCN.
- Johnson, P.G. 1976. Wildlife as a Basis for Future Tourism Development. In *Proceedings of the Symposium on the Okavango Delta and its Future Utilisation*, pp. 235-243. Gaborone, Botswana: Botswana Society.
- Johnston, B.R. 1990. Introduction: Breaking out of the Tourist Trap. *Cultural Survival Quarterly* 14(1): 2-5.
- Kalahari Conservation Society. 1988a. *Sustainable Wildlife Utilisation: The Role of Wildlife Management Areas*. Gaborone, Botswana: Kalahari Conservation Society.
- Kalahari Conservation Society. 1988b. *Management Plan for the Central Kalahari and Khutse Game Reserves*. Gaborone, Botswana: Kalahari Conservation Society.
- Kahn, U., R. Hitchcock and N. Mbere. 1990. *Let Them Talk: A Review of the Accelerated Remote Area Development Programme*. Gaborone, Botswana: Ministry of Local Government and Lands and Norwegian Agency for International Development (NORAD).
- Ministry of Commerce and Industry. 1989. *Tourism Policy in Botswana: A Draft Paper Produced for Purposes of Consultation*. Gaborone, Botswana: Government Printer.

- Owens, M. and D. Owens. 1981. Preliminary Final Report on the Central Kalahari Predator Research Project. Report to the Department of Wildlife, National Parks and Tourism.
- Owens, M. and D. Owens. 1984. *Cry of the Kalahari*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co.
- Silberbauer, G.B. 1965. *Report to the Government of Bechuanaland on the Bushman Survey*. Gaberones: Bechuanaland Government.
- Silberbauer, G.B. 1981. *Hunter and Habitat in the Central Kalahari Desert*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Smith, V.L. 1977. Introduction. In *Hosts and Guests: The Anthropology of Tourism*, ed. Valene L. Smith, pp. 1-14. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Swain, M.B. 1977. Cuna Women and Ethnic Tourism: A Way to Persist and an Avenue to Change. In *Hosts and Guests: The Anthropology of Tourism*, ed. Valene L. Smith, pp. 71-81. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Wilkinson, P.F. 1978. The Global Distribution of National Parks and Equivalent Reserves. In *International Experience with National Parks and Related Reserves*, eds. J.G. Nelson, R.D. Needham, and D.L. Mann, pp. 603-624. Waterloo, Ontario, Canada: University of Waterloo.
- Wu, C.T. 1982. Issues of Tourism and Socio-economic Development. *Annals of Tourism Research* 9(2): 313-348.

APPENDIX I NATIONAL PARKS, GAME RESERVES AND NATIONAL MONUMENTS IN BOTSWANA

Name of Park, Reserve or Monument	District Name	Size (km ²)	Founding Date
A. Gemsbok National Park	Kgalagadi	24,304	1932
B. Mabuasehube Game Reserve	Kgalagadi	1,811	1971
C. Kutse Game Reserve	Kweneng	2,703	1971
D. Central Kalahari Game Reserve	Ghanzi	52,347	1961
E. Makgadikgadi Pans Game Reserve	Northwest, Central	3,790	1970
F. Nxai Pan National Park	Northwest	2,272	1971
G. Moremi Game Reserve	Northwest	2,788	1975
H. Chobe National Park	Chobe	10,720	1961
I. Tsodilo Hills National Monument	Northwest	132	1978
J. Aha Hills National Monument	Northwest	148	1978
K. Drotsky's Cave (Gcwihabe) National Monument	Northwest	60	1978
L. Gaborone Game Reserve	Southeast	5	1978
TOTAL		101,080	